EAEVE’s Perspective on Quality of Education to Train International Veterinarians in European Countries

Ana Ma Bravo Moral
Past President of EAEVE
# Introduction to Galician Region

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>29,574.4 km²</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population (2007)</td>
<td>2,772,533</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture &amp; Fishery turnover</td>
<td>2,168 million €</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Veterinary Faculty in Lugo
University of Santiago de Compostela

- Founded 1984 – 1st School Santiago (1882-1924)
- Founder member of EAEVE in 1988
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
HISTORY OF EVALUATION OF VETERINARY ESTABLISHMENTS IN EUROPE

- Until 1978 every country/Establishment offered a curriculum based on tradition, state regulations, etc.
- 1988: Foundation of EAEVE to develop ESEVT as a permanent system of evaluation under the umbrella of ACVT
- 1994: ACVT passed on the full responsibility of ESEVT to EAEVE
- 2000: The Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE) joint EAEVE on the responsibility of running the ESEVT
- 2018: EAEVE got accreditation and full membership of ENQA and EQAR

... 33 YEARS OF APPLICATION OF THE EUROPEAN SYSTEM OF EVALUATION OF VETERINARY TRAINING (ESEVT) IN 2018
The mission of EAEVE is to evaluate, promote and further develop the quality and standard of veterinary medical establishments and their teaching within, but not limited to, the member states of the European Union (EU) ...

...by applying the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
VEEs (Europe, n=145)

* All data are based on the response to a questionnaire on VEEs from each OIE delegate
Group 1. Ireland 1, The Netherlands 1, UK 7
Group 2. Portugal 6, Spain 11
Group 3. Albania 1, Greece 2, Israel 1, Italy 13, Romania 4
Group 4. Belgium 2, France 4
Group 5. Austria 1, Germany 5, Switzerland 1
Group 6. Denmark 1, Estonia 1, Finland 1, Latvia 1, Lithuania 1, Norway 1, Sweden 1
Group 7. Croatia 1, Czech Republic 2, Hungary 1, Poland 4, Slovakia 1, Slovenia 1
Group 8. Bosnia-Herzegovina 1, Bulgaria 2, FYROM 1, Turkey 13, Serbia 1, Jordan 1

*Italics: non EU members*

ESTABLISHMENTS

96 in 34 countries
75 in EU
The Association: Foundation, Mission and Objectives:

The European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE) was founded in 1988 and initially based in Maisons-Alfort, France. Later, the administrative office was based in Brussels, Belgium and since 2007, the seat of EAEVE and its offices have been in Vienna, Austria.

Mission Statement:

The vision for EAEVE is to be the official accreditation authority for veterinary education establishments within Europe.

The mission of the EAEVE is to evaluate, promote and further develop the quality and standard of veterinary medical establishments and their teaching within, but not limited to, the member states of the European Union (EU).

The EAEVE/VFE evaluation system gives assurance to:
- the public to know they can trust the quality of graduating veterinary surgeons and the service they deliver
- veterinary students – to know their education reaches agreed and acceptable standards
- veterinary establishments – to know that their curricula and School reaches benchmarked levels

Objectives:

The primary objective is to monitor the harmonization of the minimum standards set down in the study programme for veterinary surgeons in European Union Directive 2005/36. download

This is enabled through the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training, which is managed by the EAEVE but with joint responsibility together with the Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE). A list of Evaluated and Approved Institutions is maintained.

Other objectives are to reinforce cooperation between member establishments and to act as a forum for discussion in order to improve and harmonize veterinary education. Additional tasks are the facilitation of information exchange, staff exchange, student exchange and teaching materials exchange between members.
ENQA

2000: first established as European Network for Quality Assurance in Higher Education

2004: became the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education

Mission: to contribute significantly to the maintenance and enhancement of the quality of European higher education, and to act as a major driving force for the development of quality assurance across all the Bologna Process signatory countries.

ENQA IS THE AUDITOR AND THE VOICE OF THE EUROPEAN QUALITY ASSURANCE AGENCIES
EQAR
https://www.eqar.eu/

✓ Founded by the E4 (ENQA, EURASHE, ESU and EUA) in 2008

✓ Database of higher education institutions and programmes that have been subject to external quality assurance as well as providing easy access to the corresponding reports.

✓ EQAR is the EHEA’s official register of QAAs, listing those that substantially comply with the ESG → the trustworthy quality assurance agencies in the European Higher Education Area.
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
EU REGULATED PROFESSIONS

• 78/1026/EEC: recognition of veterinary education
• 78/1027/EEC: minimum requirements of training
• 78/1028/EEC: Advisory Committee on Veterinary Training
• 2005/36/EC: Recognition of Professional Qualifications amended by 2013/55/EU

• Doctors
• Nurses (general practice)
• Dental practitioners
• Veterinary Surgeons
• Midwives
• Pharmacists
• Architects

ESEVT
(EAEVE + FVE)

1985 TO DATE
PRINCIPLES OF THE ESEVT

- Focuses on undergraduate veterinary education to ensure a comparably high standard throughout the EU making the mutual recognition of qualifications possible (EU Directives 36/2005 & 55/2013).
- The only Europe-wide profession specific evaluation system.
- Carried out by the EAEVE in co-operation with the FVE.
- Final decision taken by an independent body: ECOVE (European Committee on Veterinary Education).
- Evaluations should be carried out periodically at 7 year intervals.
- Based on the application of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) previously approved and regularly updated.
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
Focuses on undergraduate veterinary education to ensure a comparably high standard throughout the EU making the mutual recognition of qualifications possible (EU Directives 36/2005 & 55/2013).

The only Europe-wide profession specific evaluation system.

Carried out by the EAEVE in co-operation with the FVE.

Final decision taken by an independent body: ECOVE (European Committee on Veterinary Education).

Evaluations should be carried out periodically at 7 year intervals.

Based on the application of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) previously approved and regularly updated.
ESEVT IS A COMPETENCE-BASED EVALUATION PROCESS

SOP 2016

- In agreement with EU directives and ESG 2015
- Harmonised with sister accreditation agencies
- Simple, concise, clear and consistent

Available on the EAEVE website:
www.eaeve.org/esevt/sop

Table of contents

Introduction ................................................................. 3

Chapter 1. Basic documents for the recognition of professional qualifications and for Quality Assurance in the EU ........................................ 4

Chapter 2. ESEVT evaluation process ................................ 5
1. Visitations ......................................................... 5
2. Re-visitations .................................................... 12
3. Consultative Visitations ........................................ 15
4. Interim Report .................................................... 16

Chapter 3. ESEVT Standards for Accreditation ................. 18
Standard 1: Objectives and Organisation ............................ 18
Standard 2: Finances ............................................... 19
Standard 3: Curriculum .............................................. 19
Standard 4: Facilities and equipment ................................ 20
Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin .......................... 22
Standard 6: Learning resources .................................... 22
Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare .......... 23
Standard 8: Student assessment ...................................... 24
Standard 9: Academic and support staff ............................ 25
Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education ................. 26
Standard 11: Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance ...... 26

Annex 2. List of subjects and Dry One Competences ............... 29
Annex 3. List of European Standards for Quality Assurance in European Higher Education Area .... 34
Annex 4. ESEVT Indicators ........................................... 37
FULLY COMPLIANT WITH ESEVT DAY-1 COMPETENCIES!
OIE COMPETENCY-BASED CURRICULUM

ESEVT ‘Uppsala’ SOP May 2016

Table of contents

Introduction .................................................................................................................. 3

Chapter 1. Basic documents for the recognition of professional qualifications and for Quality Assurance in the EU .................................................. 4

Chapter 2. ESEVT evaluation process .................................................................... 5
1. Visitations ......................................................................................................... 5
2. Re-visitations .................................................................................................... 12
3. Consultative Visitations .................................................................................. 15
4. Interim Report .................................................................................................. 16

Chapter 3. ESEVT Standards for Accreditation .................................................... 18
Standard 1: Objectives and Organisation ............................................................... 18
Standard 2: Finances ............................................................................................ 19
Standard 3: Curriculum ......................................................................................... 19
Standard 4: Facilities and equipment ................................................................... 20
Standard 5: Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin ................. 22
Standard 6: Learning resources ........................................................................... 22
Standard 7: Student admission, progression and welfare ..................................... 23
Standard 8: Student assessment .......................................................................... 24
Standard 9: Academic and support staff ............................................................... 25
Standard 10: Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education . 26
Standard 11: Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance ............................... 26

Annex 2. List of subjects and Day One Competences ........................................... 29
Annex 3. List of European Standards for Quality Assurance in European Higher Education Area .................................................. 34
Annex 4. ESEVT Indicators .................................................................................. 37

Veterinary Education Core Curriculum
OIE Guidelines

ESEVT & OIE CURRICULUM

FULLY COMPLIANT WITH EU DIRECTIVE 36/2005!
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
ESEVT’s principal aim in **setting standards**, and **evaluating** the Establishment against **them by peers to ensure** that the Establishment:

- is well managed
- has adequate financing to sustain its educational, research and social commitments
- has appropriate resources of staff, facilities and animals
- provides an up to date professional curriculum
- provides an appropriate learning environment
- operates a fair and reliable assessment system
- operates QA and quality enhancement mechanisms.
ESEVT Standards for Accreditation & Self Evaluation Report (SER)

- **Standard 1** Objectives and Organisation
- **Standard 2** Finances
- **Standard 3** Curriculum
- **Standard 4** Facilities and equipment
- **Standard 5** Animal resources and teaching material of animal origin
- **Standard 6** Learning resources
- **Standard 7** Student admission, progression and welfare
- **Standard 8** Student assessment
- **Standard 9** Academic and support staff
- **Standard 10** Research programmes, continuing and postgraduate education
- **Standard 11** Outcome Assessment and Quality Assurance
The Establishment must

• have a culture of QA and continued enhancement of quality
• operate cyclical, sustainable and transparent QA and quality enhancement mechanisms
• inform regularly staff, students and stakeholders and involve them in the QA processes
• close the loop of the QA Plan-Do-Check-Adjust (PDCA) cycle for all standards
ESEVT INDICATORS

- 22 Indicators
- Automatically calculated in the SER

1. Staff and students
2. Hours of training
3. Types of training
4. Animal resources (patients, herds, necropsies)

- All values represent an annual average calculated from the last 3 complete academic years
- Recommended ranges based on averages observed in accredited schools (updated yearly)
14. **ESEVT Rubrics** (summary of the decision of the Visitation Team of the Establishment for each ESEVT Standard, i.e. (total or substantial) compliance (C), partial compliance (PC) (Minor Deficiency) or non-compliance (NC) (Major Deficiency))

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard 1: Objectives and Organisation</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>PC</th>
<th>NC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1. The Establishment must have as its main objective to provide, in agreement with the EU Directives and ESG recommendations, adequate, ethical, research-based, evidence-based veterinary training that enables the new graduate to perform as a veterinarian capable of entering all commonly recognised branches of the veterinary profession and to be aware of the importance of lifelong learning.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. The Establishment must develop and follow its mission statement which must embrace all the ESEVT standards.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. The Establishment must be part of a university or a higher education institution providing training recognised as being of an equivalent level and formally recognised as such in the respective country.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4. The person responsible for the veterinary curriculum and the person(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the Veterinary Teaching Hospital (VTH) must hold a veterinary degree.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5. The organisational structure must allow input not only from staff and students but also from external stakeholders.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6. The Establishment must have a strategic plan, which includes a SWOT analysis of its current activities, a list of objectives, and an operating plan with timeframe and indicators for its implementation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Five types of evaluation are organised by ESEVT

- Full Visitation
- Re-visitation
- Interim Report
- Consultative Visitation
- Joint Visitation
Group of 8 visitors: experts in Basic Sciences, Clinical Sciences Companion Animals, Clinical Sciences Food-Producing-Animals, Food Safety and Quality and QA + 1 practitioner, 1 student & 1 ESEVT coordinator (often + 1 observer from the national QA agency for Higher Education)

5 days visitation based on a standardised programme

Visitation Report and ECOVE decision available to the public
Group of 2 visitors: the Chairperson of the previous Visitation and ESEVT coordinator

2 days visitation based on a standard programme

Objective: verify if the Major Deficiencies identified during the full Visitation have been fully corrected and if an on-going process is in place in order to correct the Minor Deficiencies
CONTENT

- Any major changes which may affect the compliance to the ESEVT Standards since the previous SER
- Progress in the correction of Deficiencies *if any* and plans for the near future
- Expected date of the next Visitation
- Updated ESEVT Indicators

PROCEDURE

- Completed cyclically by the Establishment
- Reviewed by one ESEVT coordinator
- Discussed by ECOVE
Opportunity for non European countries

Pre-requisite for new members (pre-accreditation)

Advisory/audit visitation

Team: 1 coordinator + 2 experts

Visit: 2 full days
  - Day 1: facilities, equipment
  - Day 2: meetings with relevant people

Confidential Report
‘.. ECOVE may accept to share Visitors with other veterinary accreditation bodies in case of Joint Visitation ...’

SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS

- The joint Visitation Team must include among others 1 ESEVT Coordinator, 1 Student and no less than 2 ESEVT Experts
- All ESEVT fields of expertise (i.e. BS, CS-CA, CS-FPA, FSQ, QA) must be covered within the joint Visitation team
- The Visitation Agreement, the SER and the Visitation Report must be written in agreement with the ESEVT SOP
- The Visitation programme must be compliant with the ESEVT SOP
IMPACT OF ESEVT IN THE QA OF THE ESTABLISHMENT
The example of Zagreb (by Prof. Alen Slavica)
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- **Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes**
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
ESEVT INTERNAL QA PROCESSES

ESEVT-specific
✓ feedback collection - questionnaires
✓ system-wide analyses
✓ expert training: e-learning, seminars on QA
✓ ESEVT-specific CIQA tasks

EAEVE-specific
✓ CIQA
✓ ENQA evaluations and membership
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- **Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective**
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
"8.4.4. Ex-post evaluation of training programmes
In the course of the evaluation, stakeholders widely discussed the possibility of building on an ex-post evaluation system of veterinary training programmes run by the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE) and the Federation of Veterinarians of Europe (FVE). Some stakeholders suggested granting the EAEVE evaluation a formal status, either within individual Member States, or at EU level. The ex-post evaluation could lead to a possible licensing of training programmes. However, similar ex-post evaluation programs do not exist for the other health professions (or for architects). It would be inconsistent to consider such method only for the veterinary profession but not with regard to health professions dealing with patients."
ESEVT has proven to be more focused on the acquisition and assessment of professional competencies by veterinary undergraduates and therefore better adapted to the market and societal needs than the current National Accreditation Systems that are not profession specific.

Development of a GLOBAL ACCREDITATION SYSTEM FOR VEEs
THE FUTURE OF ESEVT

✓ AVMA & COE (American Veterinary Medical Association and its Committee on Education)
✓ AVBC (Australasian Veterinary Boards Council)
✓ SAVC (South African Veterinary Council)
✓ RCVS (Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons)
✓ ESEVT (EAEVE/FVE)

GLOBAL ACCREDITATION SYSTEM OF VEEs
OUTLINE

- Introduction of the European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education (EAEVE)
- Introduction of the European System of Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: A competency-based process
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: External peer-review system
- Principles of Quality Assurance (QA) implemented in the ESEVT: Internal QA processes
- Future directions of ESEVT from the QA perspective
- ESEVT value: Outcomes
ACCREDITATION PROCEDURES FOLLOWED BY EAEVE MEMBERS \((N=74)\)

- **National**: 59
- **ESEVT**: 74
- **RCVS**: 6
- **AVMA**: 6
- **AVBC**: 3
- **ISO 9001**: 4

**European System Evaluation of Veterinary Training (ESEVT)**
ESEVT VALUE: OUTCOMES

Around 25 visitations/year

✓ Accreditation in case of no Major Deficiency
✓ Conditional Accreditation in case of 1 single Major Deficiency
✓ Non Accreditation in case of several Major Deficiencies
Establishments’ status (January 2018)

MEMBERS: 96

- Non evaluated (yet) by the ESEVT: 13 (13.5%)
- Evaluated by the ESEVT: 83 (86.5%)
  - Approved + accredited: 50 + 17 = 67 (70%)
  - Conditionally approved + accredited: 5 + 0 = 5 (5.2%)
  - Non-approved: 11 (11.5%)

From 20% (1997) to 80% (2018) conditionally accredited VEEs!!
Other countries (to be) evaluated by ESEVT

May 2018

Egypt: 1
Iran: 1
Japan: 5
Mongolia: 1
Morocco: 1
Senegal: 1
Russia: 5
Thailand: 1
Tunisia: 1
Ukraine: 1
...
ESEVT VALUE: OUTCOMES

Based on
- compliance with well-described standards
- completion by independent and trained experts
- permanent improvement of its SOP

The ESEVT has shown to be efficient to
- convince the local authorities to fund the correction of the identified deficiencies
- convince the local staff to amend the curriculum
- improve the veterinary education and adapt it to the requirements of the society
Expensive, overtime work, stressful .... but worthy!
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- **Facilities:** lack or not appropriate (hospital, necropsy room, isolation units..)
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Biosafety not appropriate
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Lack of mobile clinic for food producing animals
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Non running emergency service 24h/7 all year round
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Caseload in clinics: low or lack of species
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Non appropriate “hands on” training of students
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Insufficient teaching in Food Hygiene, Animal Production, visits to slaughterhouses
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- Problems with animal welfare
EXAMPLES OF MAJOR DEFICIENCIES

- To follow the ESEVT every 7 years
- To establish an Internal QA Committee
  - Handbook for Internal Quality Management in Competence-Based Higher Education
  - Instructions to Implement the European Toolkit for Internal Quality Management in Competence-Based Higher Education [http://www.iqm-he.eu/](http://www.iqm-he.eu/)
THANKS FOR YOUR ATTENTION

TOKYO- JAPAN